

City of Cleveland
Justin M. Bibb, Mayor
Department of Community Development
Alyssa Hernandez, Director



Response to Questions

RFP for Professional Services for Economical Infill Housing

- **Site Plans**
- **Floorplans & Elevations**
- **Cost Estimates**

August 28, 2023

1. Again, free designs. Are our home designs and ideas copyrighted?

This the first step to redeveloping City land, we are looking to hire an architect to design four different housing types. Not looking for free work.

Deliverables under any awarded contract will become property of City of Cleveland, subject to the terms and conditions of the contract.

2. It appears that it is a simple pricing approach based upon type

Correct we are looking for 6 prices, one for each of the following types

- Detached Single-Family with \$100,000 construction cost
- Detached Single-Family with \$175,000 construction cost
- Detached Single-Family with \$250,000 construction cost
- Detached 1 car garage optional add-on
- Detached 2 car garage optional add-on
- Tiny Home with \$25,000 construction cost, to address unsheltered population

The price should encompass being able to deliver the services described in the RFP document.

2. you might pick different firms for different types based upon price?

On page 4 of the RFP Memo we overview the selection process, which does include the possibility of selecting more than one proposal.

3. I didn't see a way to include any information in the web form regarding this

The form now included the File Upload component located at the bottom of the form. Provide this information as proof of your experience will be important in your submission.

4. I just wanted to confirm that the goal for your RFP is a simple approach for small houses, one per lot, keep it simple at this point.

For the following, we are only considering one house per lot:

- Detached Single-Family with \$100,000 construction cost
- Detached Single-Family with \$175,000 construction cost
- Detached Single-Family with \$250,000 construction cost

For the following we are open to multiple units per parcel:

- Tiny Home with \$25,000 construction cost, to address unsheltered population

However, that does not limit opportunities to consider alternatives, since we state on page 2 of the RFP Memo "Open to unique, novel and innovative approaches."

5. The RFP response appears to be geared towards a lowest common denominator cost-based design solution

The market in Cleveland for homes over \$350k is being satisfied by developers.

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

Cleveland recently adopted a 10 Year Housing Equity Plan and shows a significant need to provide housing options below this price point.

The City expends approximate \$5M each year to subsidize housing to make it more affordable, but we are looking to see if there are ways to provide models that are designed to be affordable from a construction standpoint.

To meet the actual need of housing development over the next 10 year we need to be producing around 2,000 housing units per year. We are currently at 350-450 per year.

For more on the 10 Year Housing Equity Plan you can find it here:

https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fi/fb3a1qi0vpqv4lneksmdh/1-ActionPlan_A-Part-1.pdf?rlkey=umu1am6u92mxf2by6z2hz8rqt&dl=0

- 6. We are a Los Angeles-based architecture firm and not familiar with construction pricing in Cleveland - are there any trade partners that can be contracted to review design proposals for pricing purposes?**

If so, can you provide a list?

The City's Office of Equal Opportunity has a database of certified vendors.

<https://cleveland.diversitycompliance.com/> Select the Search Certified Directory

If not, can we submit to this RFP in partnership with a local contractor or developer?

The City does want to achieve minority, women and/or Cleveland based contracting goals, so if having a local contractor achieves this higher policy goal of the City, it may be a benefit. The Office of Equal Opportunity will issue an opinion on a proposal that the Department of Community puts forward for Board of Control approval.

- 7. In lieu of trade partners, is there a specific pricing rubric or takeoff software that the city or the Land Bank typically uses to provide takeoffs and estimates?**

A consultant must be able to prove that the service deliverable goals will be achieved based on their intended approach. The City has no "specific pricing rubric or takeoff software"

- 8. Can we submit additional documents that are not included on the list of deliverables for the RFP?**

Yes, any documentation that can support your experience, expertise or demonstrate ability to deliver on the service deliverable goals can be submitted.

- 9. If so, would it be acceptable to submit preliminary design strategies or ideas?**

We don't need preliminary designs, but we would appreciate your approach that meet the deliverable goals of the professional services requested.

- 10. Will your team make public the list of questions you have received from other interested parties?**

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

Yes, we will post all written questions received and their written responses on the Finance RFP webpage located at <https://www.clevelandohio.gov/city-hall/departments/finance/request-qualificationsproposal>

11. Are we limited to submitting our proposal on Letter-sized paper (8.5x11)? Or can we format our pages to Tabloid-sized (11x17) to include larger/clearer graphics?

You may submit on 11x17, but the proposals will likely be review on desktops, we rarely print them off while scoring or evaluating

12. There is a requirement is to provide a design for optional detached garages. Do these optional garages necessarily have to be detached, or can we develop a design in which they are attached to the house itself?

We are open to attached, but would want to ensure we can discern unit cost versus the add-on.

13. Is there any graphic standard we must follow for drawings? (In other words, must we provide simple black-and-white "blueprint" drawings, or can we show our designs a bit more graphically, such as with rendered materials and more realistic details?

The standard would be be what the Planning Department requires for preliminary review.

14. we are all interested in building tiny houses, so yes we would like more details on those. Do you have a spec sheet on these houses?

No, we are interested to see what could be achieved with a \$25,000 hard cost construction budget

15. Do you also have an overall description of how these are envisioned in a neighborhood?

If it were feasible we would likely start with determining where these could be located on City Land Bank lot and where it conforms to zoning. The City has 18,000 vacant parcels in the land bank. Here is a GIS map of the City's Land Bank Inventory.

<https://clevelandgis.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=1c40c47ecdf34f42b9118cf7f83c28a4>

16. Are they in small clusters on one or two lots?

The form based zoning seems to allow higher density on a single lot, and we would look for a site (parcel or parcels) that is suitable.

17. Are they going to be in a supported community of tiny houses?

Unknown at this time.

18. Do they each have kitchens and baths or are there common kitchens and baths?

We are interested to see what could be achieved with a \$25,000 hard cost construction budget

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

19. Could the designer/applicant retain development rights? We develop modular housing that cannot be easily replicated by other developers. We are interested in offering our designs to the City for free, if we will later be hired by third parties to build the properties.

We are open to innovative ways.

In your proposal, we would need understand how you would recoup your design costs and what would occur if preliminary planning approval was not obtained.

If this design/build process resulted in the desired cost outcomes, we would look to ways of financing it.

20. Why was the form based code draft included and which parts, if any, will we need to adhere to?

The goal is for any proposed design to obtain preliminary planning approval, therefore the new code will be important.

21. What do we have to do re: the OEO forms? The link is broken and there is not additional context.

The City just rolled out a new City website on Friday Aug 18th, so most of the contents has different links. Here is the new link:

<https://www.clevelandohio.gov/sites/clevelandohio/files/2023-07/OEOSchedules0821.pdf>

22. Are there examples of existing infill programs that the City is basing this initiative off of, such as South Bend's?

Are approach is to address a cost challenge here in Cleveland. South Bend is a build by right approach if you meet their approved designs. We would like to see that as well, by is outside of the Department of Community Development purview.

23. Do the tiny homes need to have bathrooms and kitchens? Could there be one communal facility since there will be multiple units per site?

We are open to innovative approaches, but would need pass preliminary planning approval.

24. The RFP states it is seeking hard costs to build the 3 feasible economical housing types and the costs for the option of a 1 or 2 car detached garage, does the city of Cleveland have a range of acceptable sales prices for each housing type?

No, we are only looking to see what can be build with a hard cost construction budget listed in the RFP. The end use could be affordable housing or market rate housing.

- 25. The link provided in the RFP on page 3 for the Office of Equal Opportunity Vendor Forms /schedules 1 through 4 in the Cleveland Area Business Code to Bidders & Schedules is not operational @ <http://www.city.cleveland.oh.us/CityofCleveland/Home/Government/CityAgencies/Finance/PurchasesSupplies/VendorInformation>**

The City just rolled out a new City website on Friday Aug 18th, so most of the contents has different links. Here is the new link:

<https://www.clevelandohio.gov/sites/clevelandohio/files/2023-07/OEOSchedules0821.pdf>

- 26. What is City's timeline for final selection of consultant(s)?**

Depending on if we do any interview we want to make a selection within October 2023.

- 27. As a single individual working independently as a consultant, must I still fill out the minority forms?**

Yes, please complete the forms.

- 28. Does each entry have to contain examples of all price points? I'd prefer to concentrate on the higher suggested figures.**

We are letting proposers choose if they want to provide quotes for all or some. We may therefore select multiple proposals depending on what is in the best interest of the City.

- 29. I'd prefer smaller scale plans and elevations as opposed to working drawings but I might be able to have someone prepare on-line versions Is that acceptable?**

The deliverable is to meet the construction price points and obtain Planning Department preliminary approval. Planning Department may have specific requirements for submission that would need to be adhered to.

- 30. Does every design have to fit on a 35-foot lot, meaning at least 3- for setbacks on each side and/ or space for a 10- foot drive?**

Consult with the Planning Department on what flexibility you may have under zoning or form based code or if they think a variance would be a reasonable request to address a hardship.

- 31. Can I just provide a letter from a builder offering to construct the building at a particular overall price?**

The pricing will need to be provided in the following manner: "Proforma cost estimate for the construction price point. Must meet green buildings standards and be eligible for residential tax abatement. Please items in as much detail as possible, including separating materials, labor, major elements of the housing type and utility connections." You can use a building, cost estimator, or other expert that can achieve the above.

32. What is meant by the RFP indication of “Green Initiatives”. Is there a defined standard, such as LEED Certified, WELL, etc. which must be met or in general green design initiatives should be pursued?

There are a number of methods to achieve this standard and the following handbook can assist:
<https://www.clevelandohio.gov/sites/clevelandohio/files/GreenBuildingStandardsHandbook2018.pdf>

33. Are there space programs for the three house price points, including:

- Size of living space,
- Number of bedrooms,
- Required bathroom fixtures
- Required kitchen equipment
- Is laundry included?
- Is air conditioning required?
- Are any outside spaces required?
- Does the budget encompass house construction only, with site work and utility connections in a separate budget?

The Housing Unit should meet the minimum requirements of the building code and we are looking for innovations/amenities that would make economic. We are not prescribing all the elements listed above, but we do want a housing product that meets modern expectations while controlling construction costs. Yes, site work, utility connections would be separate budget.

34. Tiny House

- Are bathrooms to be included?
- Can communal bathrooms be considered if multiple Tiny Houses are on one site?

Again we are looking are innovations to address homelessness open to solutions that would work under Cleveland's new Form Based Code.

Even with communal bathrooms, we still would want the following standard to be achieve:

Minimum HOME-ARP NCS Property Standards:

<https://www.hud.gov/sites/dfiles/OCHCO/documents/2021-10cpdn.pdf> Page 60

All HOME-ARP NCS units and common areas must meet all applicable State and local codes, ordinances, and requirements and the applicable provisions of HUD's Lead Safe Housing Rules at 24 CFR Part 35. In addition, all HOME-ARP NCS projects must meet the following minimum safety, sanitation, accessibility, and privacy standards:

i. Must be structurally sound to protect occupants from the elements and not pose any threat to health and safety of the occupants.

ii. Must be accessible in accordance with section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act (29 U.S.C. 794) and implementing regulations at 24 CFR part 8; the Fair Housing Act (42 U.S.C. 3601 et seq.) and implementing regulations at 24 CFR part 100; and Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act (42 U.S.C. 12131 et seq.) and implementing regulations at 24 CFR part 35, all as applicable.

*iii. Must provide each **individual or family** with an acceptable, individual **room to sleep which includes adequate space and security for themselves and their belongings.***

*iv. **Must have a natural or mechanical means of ventilation.** The interior air must be free of pollutants at a level that might threaten or harm the health of occupants.*

*v. **Must have a water supply** free of contamination.*

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

- vi. **Must have in-unit sanitary facilities** that are in proper operating condition and are adequate for personal cleanliness and the disposal of human waste. *(I remember this means a sink and toilet, so a half-bath)*
- vii. **Must provide necessary heating/cooling facilities in proper operating condition.**
- viii. Must have **adequate natural or artificial illumination** to permit normal indoor activities and support health and safety. There must be sufficient electrical sources to permit the safe use of electrical appliances.
- ix. **Food preparation areas**, if any, must contain suitable space and equipment to store, prepare, and serve food in a safe and sanitary manner. *(A microwave is sufficient)*
- x. Must provide one **working smoke detector and one working carbon monoxide detector** in each unit. All smoke and carbon monoxide detectors and alarm systems must be designed for hearing-impaired residents. All public areas of the shelter must have at least one working smoke detector and one carbon monoxide detector. There must also be a second means of exiting the building in the event of fire or other emergency.

35. Deliverables: under floor plan and elevation deliverables, the RFQ states: “The standard for the site plan shall be what is necessary to obtain preliminary approval from the Planning Department”.

- Was the intention to modify this sentence to reference plans and elevations instead of the site plan?
- Can you provide a sample site plan that shows what would be required by the Planning Department so that the level of required planning detail is clear?
- We presume that you are not requesting planning to the level required to secure a building permit, but rather Planning Department approval. Please confirm.

The following are the components need to submit for preliminary (conceptual) approval:

1. Application Form Written Project Summary (including location, scale, investment; number of units, square feet, residents, employees, parking spaces; potential code issues; and any other pertinent information including but not limited to sustainable features.) <https://planning.clevelandohio.gov/designreview/DesignReviewApplicationFormExtended.pdf>
2. Site Location Map (district level)
3. Site Context Plan (i.e., site plan showing adjoining properties, buildings and street names)
4. Existing Conditions Plan (color photographs; site context, including nearby buildings)
5. Site Plan (include: north arrow, scale, legend and key dimensions and notes)
6. Section / Elevation Drawings (including color versions, if requested)
7. Floor Plans (typical floors)
8. Tree Preservation Plan (Applies to projects over 1 acre, or new construction > 4 units see Chapter 341.051, and contact Jennifer Kipp, JKipp@clevelandohio.gov)

Here is Planning Commissions Guide for applicants. https://planning.clevelandohio.gov/designreview/applicantsGuide12_2016.pdf Department of Community Development can represent what Planning Commission will access beyond the information

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

above.

We are not requesting that this feasibility design secure a building permit.

36. The RFP indicates that the planning must meet “green building standards”. Please identify exactly what standards are to be met.

There are a number of methods to achieve this standard and the following handbook can assist:
<https://www.clevelandohio.gov/sites/clevelandohio/files/GreenBuildingStandardsHandbook2018.pdf>

37. The RFP indicates that the planning must be eligible for residential tax abatement. Please provide those eligibility requirements.

Green building standard is the key element for single-family construction to secure a residential tax abatement.

38. We intend to fulfill the required CSB / MBE / FBE participation with a local firm to provide cost estimating and input on local issues during the design stages. Can the City provide a list of firms who we could contact for these services? We could not locate such firms through the City’s website.

Office of Equal Opportunity maintains a database of certified vendors that maybe able to help: <https://cleveland.diversitycompliance.com/>

39. Some of the lower budget targets suggest solutions may involve highly compact floor areas and/or significant economy in budgets for the exterior design limiting available materials, window quantities, etc. Does the Planning Commission intend to support any flexibility in design standards and expectations in order to support achievement of the target budgets?

With the new Form Based Code and the overwhelming need we want this to be an exercise and a discussion with Planning to develop housing for all needs.

40. We understand the designs are intended to fit generic sites. Will intended neighborhoods or representative site locations be identified for the purposes of establishing design context and/or zoning districts?

The overwhelming available land to develop is vacant parcels in the City’s Land Bank. Here is a summary of the sizes we are working with and why we selected approximately 4,000 square feet in size with 35 feet of frontage..

Lot Frontage		Lot Area		Lot Depth	
Average	41.67525027	Average	5024.268172	Average	101.0642382
Median	40	Median	4400	Median	110
< 20	509	< 2000	770	< 100	5432

This Request For Proposal (RFP) document is the property of the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development. It contains proprietary information about the business of the City of Cleveland.

20-25	215	2000-2500	824	100-125	4839
25-30	629	2500-3000	1037	125-150	3746
30-35	2518	3000-3500	1524	> 150	1768
35-40	3507	3500-4000	1802		
40-45	5867	4000-4500	2296		
45-50	660	4500-5000	1876		
> 50	1978	> 5000	7692		

41. The new Form-based Zoning Code is referenced in the City’s SmartSheet project page but not the RFP document. The Form-based code currently exists in draft form, but is not yet to our knowledge adopted for use. Should prototype designs comply with current zoning, the proposed form-based code, or both?

Planning Department has suggested we consult the Form Based Code section for this project.

42. If the project is expected to comply with zoning, will the Planning Commission support variances where budget limits and compact floor plans challenge the viability of meeting thresholds such as minimum lot area, minimum building floor area, street frontage build-out, etc.?

Correct, We are open to solutions or innovations, more units on a lot, or variance request.

43. Project deliverables indicate providing “what is necessary to obtain preliminary approval from the Planning Department”. Is it intended that the designs obtain preliminary approvals as part of required deliverables, or does this requirement solely reference the level of drawing detail and design development expected for each prototype?

Preliminary approval is part the deliverable for the project.

44. Should proposals include time to take each prototype through the preliminary stage of Design Review and Planning Commission approvals?

Yes, would like an estimated timeframe for the entire project.

45. Should proposals include time to present zoning variance requests to the Planning Commission or BZA in the event a target budget results in a design that is not zoning compliant by-right?

We would need to know that specific variances needed and maybe a conversation with planning or zba staff regarding the reasonableness of the request. Since a variance runs with the land, this project will not identify an actual location.

46. Cost methodology: Construction costs can vary widely for the same building design based on a variety of factors. For the purposes of estimating construction costs to determine success in meeting target price points, are there expectations that should be incorporated?

Any reasonable industry standard subject to the following: "Proforma cost estimate for the construction price point. Must meet green buildings standards and be eligible for residential tax abatement. Please items in as much detail as possible, including separating materials, labor, major elements of the housing type and utility connections."

47. Construction of a single unit as a one-time occurrence vs. production home building of multiple similar homes on proximate parcels on a simultaneous basis to create economies of scale?

We want to know what innovation will be need to deliver the units at the construction price point. We are open to economies of scale, but something reasonable to a neighborhood, such as increments of 10 units.

48. If production-scale construction can be assumed, can off-site factory manufacturing be included?

Yes

49. Should construction cost estimates assume any specific City of Cleveland requirements beyond green building standards? (prevailing wage, CSB/MBE/FBE, etc.)

Not for this project.

50. Can a baseline date for assumed construction start be identified so market fluctuation and volatility over the duration of the project can be removed from the equation?

2nd or 3rd quarter of 2024.